

Metastability of the Three-Dimensional Carbon Cluster Prismane C_8

V. F. Elesin, A. I. Podlivaev, L. A. Openov

Moscow State Engineering Physics Institute (Technical University),

Kashirskoe sh. 31, Moscow 115409, Russia

Stability of recently predicted cage-like carbon cluster C_8 (prismane) against its transformations to structures lying at lower energies is studied theoretically. The smallest energy barrier inhibiting prismane transformation is shown to be 0.44 eV, in qualitative agreement with the value of activation energy for prismane decay calculated by molecular dynamics simulations. A rather high value of the barrier suggests the possibility of experimental observation of this cluster at ambient pressure.

1. Introduction

Since fullerenes C_{60} have been discovered [1] and synthesized in macroscopic quantities [2], there is a growing interest in carbon clusters and nanostructures [3, 4, 5]. This interest has both fundamental and applied aspects. On the one hand, small carbon clusters composed of $N \sim 10 - 100$ atoms differ from macroscopic samples (and even from nanoparticles composed of $N \sim 10^4 - 10^5$ atoms) in that there are no "inner" atoms in such clusters, i.e. all atoms constituting the cluster lie on its "surface". A principal impossibility to subdivide interatomic bonding into bulk and surface parts results in essentially new physics and makes small clusters extremely interesting objects for basic research [6, 7]. On the other hand, some unusual properties of small carbon clusters can be used for practical purposes. For example,

metastable cubane C_8H_8 is considered as a high-energy-density material that can store a considerable amount of energy [6]; there is a hope that doping of C_{36} fullerene can result in its phase transition to a superconducting state with an anomalously high critical temperature T_c enhanced over the alkali-intercalated C_{60} compounds [8], etc.

In order the small clusters could form bulk structures by means of intercluster bonding, they should be *three-dimensional*. Three-dimensional carbon clusters (cages) are believed to be stable for $N \geq 20$ only [9, 10, 11], while for clusters with $N < 20$ the stable structures are either one-dimensional (chains) or two-dimensional (rings) [7, 9, 11]. However, for $N < 20$, carbon clusters can exist in three-dimensional *metastable* states whose binding energies are higher than the binding energy of the stable cluster with the same N (for example, the occurrence of a metastable C_{14} cage has been reported in Ref. [10], based on the results of density functional calculations).

Several cage-like metastable isomers C_8 have been proposed in Refs. [12, 13, 14] using the Harris-functional approximation combined with a generalized-gradient approximation [12], the local spin density and gradient-corrected approximations to the exchange-correlation energy [13] as well as the transferable tight-binding potential [14]. As far as we know, eight-atom isomers have not been observed experimentally yet, they are the smallest three-dimensional carbon clusters found so far theoretically. The key issue for a possibility of experimental observation of such clusters is their relative stability. Note, however, that the stability of isomers C_8 have not been quantified in refs. [12, 13], e.g., the transformations to structures lying at lower energies have not been studied. Meanwhile, the results of *ab initio* calculations are known to depend strongly on the way that electron correlations are treated [7, 13],

and hence a conclusion about the cluster metastability may appear to be just an artifact of approximations used.

Recently we have predicted [14] the existence of an eight-atom metastable cage-like cluster C_8 that has the shape of a six-atom triangular prism with two excess atoms above and below its bases. We gave this cluster the name "prismane". It is shown in Fig.1. The binding energy of prismane is 0.45 eV/atom higher than the binding energy of the stable one-dimensional eight-atom cluster shown in Fig.2. Nevertheless, molecular dynamics simulations gave evidence for a relatively high stability of prismane, the activation energy for prismane decay was estimated to be about 1 eV [14], suggesting that prismane lifetime is rather long and that this cluster may be observed experimentally.

However, although the finite-temperature molecular dynamics simulations provide the most direct way for evaluation of the cluster lifetime, such calculations are extremely time-consuming since the process of cluster decay is probabilistic in nature, and hence a huge statistics should be accumulated in order to draw a definite conclusion about the values of the cluster lifetime and activation energy. Alternatively, useful complementary information concerning characteristics of the metastable state can be provided by calculations of the heights of energy barriers inhibiting spontaneous transformation of the cluster to the lower-energy atomic configuration. Such calculations have been carried out, e.g., to study the atmospheric-pressure stability of energetic phases of carbon [15] and polymeric nitrogen [16]. It was the purpose of this work to find the minimum energy barrier separating the metastable prismane structure C_8 shown in Fig.1 from the stable chain structure in order to see if such a cluster can be observed experimentally at non-exotic conditions.

2. Computational details

To calculate the binding energy of a cluster having an arbitrary atomic configuration, we have used a transferable tight-binding potential [11, 17] that had been proven to reproduce accurately the energy-versus-volume diagram of carbon polytypes and to give a good description of both small clusters and bulk structures of carbon [11, 17]. On the one hand, this potential describes the structure and energetics of small carbon clusters quite well, the difference in bond lengths and binding energies between our results and available *ab initio* calculations [7] usually did not exceed 10%. On the other hand, the technique used greatly simplifies a reliable evaluation of characteristics of metastable states as compared with *ab initio* approaches [18, 19].

The search for the minimum energy barrier separating two locally stable atomic configurations is equivalent to the search for a saddle point in the total-energy surface as a function of the atomic coordinates. Such a saddle point corresponds to the unstable configuration of atoms in the cluster. The algorithm of the search for a saddle point is based on a continuous transformation of the cluster along the directions of atomic motion in the softest oscillation mode of the cluster, i.e. the mode with the minimum oscillation frequency. This algorithm is analogous to the "soft-mode walking" procedure [20] in which the information regarding both gradients and Hessian (energy curvatures) is used to systematically proceed up the bottom of a valley (local minimum) to a transition (saddle) state. In uphill walks from the minimum-energy geometry of the cluster to the transition state, the energy is maximized in the soft-mode direction and minimized in all orthogonal directions, thereby forcing the walk to be in a stream bed [20]. Apart from the efficient search for a saddle point, such an algorithm gives the energy spectrum of mechanical oscillations of the

cluster. The knowledge of this spectrum allows for a reliable discrimination between the metastable and long-living unstable states of the cluster (sometimes this cannot be done by means of molecular dynamics simulations).

All calculations were carried out at pressure $P = 0$, i.e. in fact at ambient (atmospheric) pressure [16].

3. Results and discussion

We define the binding energy E_b of a C_8 cluster as

$$E_b = E(8) - 8E(1), \quad (1)$$

i.e. as the difference between the total energy of the cluster, $E(8)$, and the energy $8E(1)$ of eight isolated carbon atoms. The binding energy of the metastable prismane (P) is $E_b^P = -40.80$ eV. The binding energy of the stable eight-atom chain (C) is $E_b^C = -44.37$ eV.

Starting with the prismane structure, we first computed the energy spectrum of its mechanical oscillations. We have found that all oscillation frequencies are real, giving evidence that the prismane structure corresponds to a local minimum in the total-energy surface as a function of the atomic coordinates, i.e. the prismane is indeed a metastable cluster.

We now consider the energetics associated with the prismane transformation to the stable chain configuration in the soft-mode direction. Fig.3 shows the difference $\Delta E_b = E_b - E_b^C$ between the binding energy of the transformed C_8 cluster, E_b , and E_b^C versus the generalized transformation coordinate R defined as a mean square deviation of atomic coordinates x_i, y_i, z_i of the transformed cluster from their corresponding values x_{i0}, y_{i0}, z_{i0} in the prismane structure ($i = 1 - 8$ is the number of

atom in the cluster):

$$R^2 = \sum_{i=1}^8 [(x_i - x_{i0})^2 + (y_i - y_{i0})^2 + (z_i - z_{i0})^2]. \quad (2)$$

One can see that the function $\Delta E_b(R)$ has a local minimum at $R = 0$ corresponding to the metastable prismane structure. The value of $\Delta E_b(R)$ increases with R and passes through the maximum S1 at $R \approx 0.5 \text{ \AA}$. This maximum corresponds to the unstable configuration "scorpion" shown in Fig.4. The binding energy of the "scorpion" is $E_b^{S1} = -40.36 \text{ eV}$, so that the energy barrier inhibiting spontaneous prismane transformation to the lower-energy atomic configuration appears to be $U = E_b^{S1} - E_b^P = 0.44 \text{ eV}$.

We have found (see Fig.3) that further increase in R leads to the prismane transformation at $R \approx 6.5 \text{ \AA}$ not into the stable eight-atom chain (as one could expect) but into another metastable configuration "frying pan" (FP) shown in Fig.5. This configuration corresponds to the local minimum in the total-energy surface. The binding energy of the "frying pan" $E_b^{FP} = -42.85 \text{ eV}$ is 2.05 eV below the binding energy E_b^P of the prismane but 1.52 eV higher than that of the stable chain, E_b^C .

Next we have studied the transformation path of the "frying pan" in its soft-mode direction. Fig.6 shows the value of $\Delta E_b = E_b - E_b^C$ as a function of the transformation coordinate R defined by Eq.(2), where x_{i0} , y_{i0} , z_{i0} are now the atomic coordinates of the "frying pan". One can see that $\Delta E_b(R)$ first increases with R , passes through the maximum S2 at $R \approx 2.7 \text{ \AA}$ and then decreases down to zero at $R \approx 6 \text{ \AA}$, so that the stable chain structure (see Fig.2) is finally reached. The maximum of $\Delta E_b(R)$ corresponds to the unstable configuration shown in Fig.7. The binding energy of this configuration is $E_b^{S2} = -42.08 \text{ eV}$, so that the energy barrier inhibiting the "frying pan" transformation to the linear chain is equal to $U_1 = E_b^{S2} - E_b^{FP} = 0.77 \text{ eV}$. Hence, the prismane transformation into the stable eight-

atom chain is a two-step process that takes place via an "intermediary" metastable configuration "frying pan".

Note that there also exist the paths of prismane transformation other than that shown in Figs. 3 and 6. The latter, however, is characterized by the smallest energy barrier U inhibiting transformation of the prismane structure to the lower-energy configurations. It is the path with the smallest barrier that is key to the issue of metastability.

We stress that the data of finite-temperature molecular-dynamics simulation [14] are consistent with the results presented above. For all temperatures studied, $800\text{ K} < T < 1800\text{ K}$, the prismane first transforms to the "frying pan" configuration, and next to the linear chain. The activation energy $E_a = 0.82\text{ eV}$ for prismane decay estimated in [14] on the basis of the temperature dependence of prismane lifetime is about twice the height of the smallest energy barrier $U = 0.44\text{ eV}$ calculated in this work. Note, however, that the cluster lifetime depends, in general, on the full topology of the total-energy surface, beyond just the minimum energy barrier.

4. Conclusions

We have numerically examined the metastability of recently predicted cage-like carbon cluster prismane C_8 . It was demonstrated that the minimum energy barrier separating the prismane structure from the lower-energy atomic configuration amounts to 0.44 eV . Combined with the data on finite-temperature molecular-dynamics simulation of prismane decay, our result points to rather long lifetime of the prismane in its metastable state, suggesting the possibility of experimental synthesis of this cluster.

Acknowledgments

The work was supported by the Contract DSWA01-98-C-0001 and by the Russian Federal Program "Integration", projects No A0133 and A0155.

References

- [1] H.W.Kroto, J.R.Heath, S.C.O'Brien, R.F.Curl, and R.E.Smalley, *Nature* 318 (1985) 162.
- [2] W.Krätschmer, L.D.Lamb, K.Fostiropoulos, and D.R.Huffman, *Nature* 347 (1990) 354.
- [3] A.F.Hebard, M.J.Rosseinsky, R.C.Haddon, D.W.Murphy, S.H.Glarum, T.T.M.Palstra, A.P.Ramirez, and A.R.Kortan, *Nature* 350 (1991) 600.
- [4] S.Iijima, *Nature* 354 (1991) 56.
- [5] C.Piscoti, J.Yarger, and A.Zettl, *Nature* 393 (1998) 771.
- [6] P.E.Eaton and G.J.Castaldi, *J. Am. Chem. Soc.* 107 (1985) 784, and references therein.
- [7] W.Weltner (Jr.) and R.J.Van Zee, *Chem. Rev.* 89 (1989) 1713.
- [8] M.Côté, J.C.Grossman, M.L.Cohen, and S.G.Louie, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 81 (1998) 697.
- [9] D.Tománek and M.A.Schluter, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 67 (1991) 2331.
- [10] R.O.Jones and G.Seifert, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 79 (1997) 443.
- [11] C.H.Xu, C.Z.Wang, C.T.Chan, and K.M.Ho, *Phys. Rev. B* 47 (1993) 9878.
- [12] K.Kobayashi, N.Kurita, H.Kumahora and K.Tago, *Phys. Rev. B* 45 (1992) 11299.
- [13] R.O.Jones, *J. Chem. Phys.* 110 (1999) 5189.
- [14] L.A.Openov and V.F.Elesin, *Pis'ma Zh. Éksp. Teor. Fiz.* 68 (1998) 685 [*JETP Lett.* 68 (1998) 726].

- [15] C.Mailhiot and A.K.McMahan, Phys. Rev. B 44 (1991) 11578.
- [16] C.Mailhiot, L.H.Yang, and A.K.McMahan, Phys. Rev. B 46 (1992) 14419.
- [17] C.H.Xu, C.Z.Wang, C.T.Chan, and K.M.Ho, J. Phys.: Condens. Matter 4 (1992) 6047.
- [18] T.J.Lee and J.E.Rice, J. Chem. Phys. 94 (1991) 1215.
- [19] K.M.Dunn and K.Morokuma, J. Chem. Phys. 102 (1995)49045.
- [20] J.Simons, P.Jørgensen, H.Taylor, and J.Ozment, J. Phys. Chem. 87 (1983) 2745.

Figure captions

Fig.1. Metastable prismane C_8 . Binding energy $E_b^P = -40.80$ eV. Bond lengths: $d_{AB} = 2.31$ Å, $d_{AC} = 1.28$ Å, $d_{AD} = 1.47$ Å. Bond angles: $\angle BAC = 90^\circ$, $\angle ADB = 104^\circ$, $\angle ABE = 60^\circ$.

Fig.2. Stable chain C_8 . Binding energy $E_b^C = -44.37$ eV.

Fig.3. Calculated difference $\Delta E_b = E_b - E_b^C$ between the binding energy E_b of the C_8 cluster transformed from the prismane structure (P) in the soft-mode direction and the binding energy E_b^C of the stable eight-atom chain as a function of the transformation coordinate R . The prismane structure corresponds to $R = 0$. The saddle point configuration "scorpion" (S1) is realized at $R \approx 0.5$ Å. The lower-energy metastable configuration "frying pan" (FP) is reached at $R \approx 6.5$ Å. The energy barrier for the prismane $\rightarrow$ "frying pan" transformation is $U = E_b^{S1} - E_b^P = 0.44$ eV.

Fig.4. Unstable configuration "scorpion" (S1 in Fig.3). Binding energy $E_b^{S1} = -40.36$ eV.

Fig.5. Metastable configuration "frying pan" (FP in Figs. 3 and 6). Binding energy $E_b^{FP} = -42.85$ eV.

Fig.6. Calculated difference $\Delta E_b = E_b - E_b^C$ between the binding energy E_b of the C_8 cluster transformed from the "frying pan" structure (FP) in the soft-mode direction and the binding energy E_b^C of the stable eight-atom chain as a function of the transformation coordinate R . The "frying pan" structure corresponds to $R = 0$. The saddle point configuration (S2) is realized at $R \approx 2.7$ Å. The stable chain configuration (C) is reached at $R \approx 6$ Å. The energy barrier for the "frying pan" $\rightarrow$ chain transformation is $U_1 = E_b^{S2} - E_b^{FP} = 0.77$ eV.

Fig.7. Unstable configuration S2 (see Fig.6). Binding energy $E_b^{S2} = -42.08$ eV.













